

**MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION  
OF THE CITY OF LA CANADA FLINTRIDGE  
HELD ON NOVEMBER 28, 2017**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Gunter called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m.

**II. ROLL**

Also present were Vice Chairman Hazen and Commissioners Jain and Oh. Commissioner McConnell arrived at 6:08 pm.

**III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

The Flag Salute was recited.

**IV. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC**

There were none.

**V. REORDERING OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was not reordered.

**VI. CONSENT CALENDAR**

- A. **Minutes** – 9/12/2017 Meeting; 10/16/2017 Special Meeting- M/S/C- Gunter/Hazen to approve the minutes. Approved 3-0-1. Jain abstained and McConnell had not joined the meeting yet.

**VII. CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARINGS**

There were none.

**VIII. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

- A. **Second Floor Review 17-08/Large Garage Review 17-01; ADDC/Habashy; 4231 Chula Senda Lane:** request to allow construction of a new 7,430 sq. ft. 2-story residence, inclusive of a 3-car garage to the front, on a 28,629-sq. ft. non-hillside lot. **The applicant has requested a continuance to the December 12, 2017 Planning Commission meeting.**

Commissioner Jain recused himself. The Public Hearing was opened and closed by Chairman Gunter. M/S/C- Gunter/Hazen to continue the item to a date certain of January 9, 2018. Approved 4-0-1. Jain recused himself.

Commissioner Jain rejoined the meeting at 6:09 pm.

- B. **Tree Removal Permit 17-29 (appeal); Zhang/Stoker; 4534 Lasheart Drive:** request to remove an oak tree with a 44.5-inch diameter at breast height (DBH) and an estimated height of 40-feet. The item will be reviewed as an appeal of the approval. The City approved the request on October 6, 2017. (Planning Intern Barkhordarian).

Mr. Barkhordarian gave a presentation in accordance with the staff report. He said that staff recommends the upholding of the denial.

Chairman Gunter and Director Stanley discussed approving a Resolution to deny or approve.

Chairman Gunter commended Mr. Barkhordarian for his presentation.

Commissioner Oh commented that the owner and arborist believe that there are adverse affects to the rest of the surrounding environment if the tree remains. The soil is infected with fungus. Once the tree is removed, the fungus should be remediated.

Director Stanley said that if anyone were to plant in the nearby area, soil remediation would need to take place.

The Public Hearing was opened.

Speaker, James Stoker who lives on Encinas said that he believed that the terms of the permit are deficient. He believed the arborist report does not support the findings and that it is inaccurate. He said that the street was once inhabited with many Oak trees, hence the name, "Encinas." He believed that the tree should be given time to heal. He felt that the utility company must make a determination of the tree issues. He believed that additional notice regarding trimming should be given to neighbors. He also felt that noticing was deficient.

Speaker who resides at 4530 Lasheart stated that they believed the tree is a safety problem and that the Director's decision should be upheld.

Jimmy Zhang, 4534 Lasheart said that he believed the tree poses a safety issue for his family and wishes to keep them safe. He does appreciate the concern about preserving the environment.

The Public Hearing was closed.

PC 11/28/17 - Meeting

Chairman Gunter said he was convinced the arborist and staff had done a thorough job. He said the Ordinance includes key findings that would deny the appeal.

Vice Chairman Hazen said that the subject tree is dangerous and therefore could not support the appeal.

Commissioner McConnell said he did not find anything that would support the appeal.

Commissioner Jain said he believed the arborist is the professional and that based on Southern California Edison's practices, limbs that are within 6 feet of the wiring should be removed. He upholds the decision and does not support the appeal.

Commissioner Oh said that the tree is very old and that he appreciates Oak tree preservation. However, when a mature tree threatens life safety that is a problem.

M/S/C – Hazen/McConnell to uphold the decision, deny the appeal as set forth in the resolution, and that the Title in Section two of the Resolution be changed to deny the appeal and uphold the October 6, 2017 approval of tree removal permit 17-29. Approved 5-0.

**IX. REPORT OF DIRECTOR'S REVIEWS**

Were reported.

A. **Director's Misc. Review 17-43; Fink; 1108 Fairview Drive:** allowed pool equipment within the required 6'-10" north side yard setback.

**X. OTHER BUSINESS**

There was none.

**XI. COMMENTS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS**

There were none.

**XII. COMMENTS FROM THE DIRECTOR**

There were none.

**XIII. ADJOURNMENT**

M/S/C – Gunter/Jain to adjourn the meeting at 6:48 p.m. Approved 5-0.

---

Secretary to the Planning Commission