

4. Project Size:

Lot area:	10,955 sq. ft.
Proposed 1 st floor (inc. garage):	2,453 sq. ft.
Proposed 2 nd floor:	1,366 sq. ft.
Total:	3,819 sq. ft. (0.35 FAR)

5. General Plan / Zoning / Existing Land Use:

The Land Use Map identifies the site as Low Density Residential – up to 4 Dwelling Units per Acre. The property is designated R-1-10,000 (Single Family Residential – 10,000 Square Foot Minimum Lot Size). The site is vacant.

6. Environmental Impact Review:

Staff has determined that the proposed Floor Area Review is Categorically Exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act, under Class 2.5(c)(1) (new construction) of the City of La Cañada Flintridge Guidelines for the Implementation of CEQA.

7. Previous Action:

Parcel Map 73402 – approved 1/10/2017. Divided the previous 22,010 sq. ft. lot at 743 Craig Avenue into two lots. This is the northernmost lot at 4824 Commonwealth Avenue.

8. Pending and Potential Actions:

Recordation of parcel map, Plan check, Fire Department approval, issuance of building permit.

9. Staff Analysis:

A. Context:

The subject property is one of two recently created lots at the northeast corner of Commonwealth Avenue and Craig Avenue. It is the northerly lot of a two-lot subdivision reviewed and approved by the Commission at the January 10, 2017. The subject parcel is an interior lot that fronts on Commonwealth Avenue. Lot size is 10,955 sq. ft., in excess of the 10,000 sq. ft. minimum for the underlying zone.



The neighborhood is characterized by parcels and houses of varying sizes and configurations, including several flag lots along Commonwealth Avenue. It is an eclectic area where newer and older two-story residences are commonplace. To the south (on the corner) is the second vacant lot created by the parcel map which had a two-story home approved at the last Planning Commission meeting. Immediately to the north is a two-story farmhouse, followed by a Traditional-styled home constructed in 2015. Another new two-story residence is under construction behind and to the east, while two-story homes are across the street to the west.

Parcels and homes in the immediate area include the following:

Address	Lot Size	House Size	FAR	Stories
705 Craig Avenue	11,390 S.F.	3,614 S.F.	0.32	1
711 Craig Avenue	11,390 S.F.	4,150 S.F.	0.36	2
717 Craig Avenue	12,050 S.F.	3,275 S.F.	0.27	2
721 Craig Avenue	11,617 S.F.	2,464 S.F.	0.21	1
725 Craig Avenue	13,233 S.F.	1,590 S.F.	0.12	2
727 Craig Avenue	11,617 S.F.	1,256 S.F.	0.11	2
733 Craig Avenue	10,716 S.F.	3,297 S.F.	0.31	2
4724 Commonwealth Avenue	14,950 S.F.	1,423 S.F.	0.10	1
4728 Commonwealth Avenue	7,984 S.F.	1,651 S.F.	0.21	1
4800 Commonwealth Avenue	7,965 S.F.	2,196 S.F.	0.28	1
4805 Commonwealth Avenue	16,800 S.F.	1,450 S.F.	0.09	1
4806 Commonwealth Avenue	6,628 S.F.	1,302 S.F.	0.20	1
4813 Commonwealth Avenue	17,500 S.F.	3,836 S.F.	0.22	2
4821 Commonwealth Avenue	10,010 S.F.	3,117 S.F.	0.31	2
4822 Commonwealth Avenue	11,055 S.F.	3,340 S.F.	0.30	2
4823 Commonwealth Avenue	8,090 S.F.	3,140 S.F.	0.39	2
4831 Commonwealth Avenue	7,230 S.F.	1,668 S.F.	0.23	1
4832 Commonwealth Avenue	12,801 S.F.	2,210 S.F.	0.17	1
4834 Commonwealth Avenue	10,122 S.F.	3,092 S.F.	0.30	2
4836 Commonwealth Avenue	17,546 S.F.	4,038 S.F.	0.23	2
4837 Commonwealth Avenue	7,800 S.F.	2,683 S.F.	0.34	2
4842 Commonwealth Avenue	10,010 S.F.	2,306 S.F.	0.23	2
4741 Orange Knoll Avenue	13,190 S.F.	2,911 S.F.	0.22	2
4738 Orange Knoll Avenue	12,680 S.F.	2,406 S.F.	0.19	1
AVERAGE	11,432 S.F.	2,601 S.F.	0.23	n/a
*4824 Commonwealth Avenue	10,955 S.F.	3,379 S.F.	0.31	2

(*Project site – floor area figures DO NOT include garages and other exterior covered areas and are intended for general comparison only.)

Based on the above chart, the average lot size for the area is 11,432 sq. ft., very similar to the 10,955 sq. ft. subject property. Average house size is 2,601 sq. ft. compared to 3,379 sq. ft. for the proposed residence, while the average and subject Floor Area Ratios (FAR) are 0.23 and 0.31, respectively. Overall, the proposal would result in a house larger in size and FAR than the area average on a comparably-sized parcel. There are, however, many homes of comparable size and FAR in the vicinity.

B. Project Description:

A new two-story residence and attached garage is proposed. The proposed residence is compliant with regard to all standards, including floor area, setbacks and building height. Minor site grading is also proposed to create a level pad for the new residence.

The first floor would be comprised of a living, family and dining area, and a guest bedroom, modulated by forward-projection of the 2-car garage and a recessed front porch. A minimum 40'-4" front setback would be provided as measured to the garage, above the 38'-1" requirement for the lot. To the rear, a 49'-0" setback, three times the 15'-0" requirement. With an average width of 80 feet, 8'-0" and 16'-0" interior side-yard setbacks are required, and provided at the first and second-floor levels to the north and exceeded to the south. On the south side a 13'-1" and 16'-5" first and second floor setbacks are provided. Total first-floor area inclusive of the garage would be 2,453 sq. ft.

A compact and efficient second floor housing 4 bedrooms, 3 bathrooms and a laundry room would comprise 1,366 sq. ft. The second floor would be recessed along both sides, most notably the south, to provide increased second-floor side-yard setbacks. It would also step back from the front above the garage and at the master bedroom which would reduce its massing effect as seen from the street. Overall, the window array at the second-floor level is commensurate to the interior spaces. Total project floor area would be 3,819 sq. ft., the maximum allowance for the site.

The lot's gentle slope to the southeast would be raised to create a level building pad. As such, fill height, a maximum of approximately 4 feet at the southeast corner of the footprint, would combine with structure height for an overall height of 31'-1" feet, below the 32'-0" height limit for the lot.

A new driveway would access the site on the north side of the lot. The driveway would flare to the north, which would allow guest parking onsite, as well as, turn-a-round area. Total paved area would be below the 50% maximum hardscape ratio. The A/C condensers would also satisfy the 8'-0" side-yard setback requirement. Lastly, the site plan calls out 6'-0" high fencing along the south side and rear property lines. Along the north side of the property a compliant 30" inward-facing retaining wall with 6'-0" of free-standing fence on top is also proposed. This wall is offset slightly from the property line.

In all, the request compares with code standards as follows:

	<u>STANDARD</u>	<u>PROPOSED</u>
Floor Area:	3,820 S.F.	3,819 S.F.
Front SB:	38'-0"	38'-1"
North Side SB		
1st floor:	8'-0"	8'-0"
2nd floor:	16'-0"	16'-0"
South Side SB		
1st floor:	8'-0"	13'-1"
2nd floor:	16'-0"	16'-5"

Rear SB:	15'-0"	49'-0"
Height:	32'-0"	31'-1"

C. Second Floor Review:

Discussion

Given the development pattern apparent along Commonwealth Avenue and Craig Avenue, and frequency of two-story homes, the introduction of a new two-story Traditional-style design, with its tasteful massing and accents, would blend well within the area. Reinforcing the appropriateness of the home's design and scale are the adjacent two-story homes to the north, south, east and west.

The structure is well-articulated and detailed, as evidenced by horizontal and vertical recesses along the building's perimeter and stepped roof form. The new residence would be built in proportion to the lot's size and sited to respect all constraints. Front setbacks would be visually augmented by unusually deep 18'-0" parkway along Commonwealth Avenue; as such, the home would not impose on the street or neighboring homes. View corridors from adjacent properties would not be significantly impacted given the number of large oak canopies that envelope the streetscape.

The rear elevation and second-floor windows of the subject house would have direct exposure the rear yard of the house at 733 Craig Avenue but the 49'+ intervening distance would mitigate any privacy issues. Additional landscape screening would also alleviate any privacy concerns. In addition, a landscape plan was approved as part of the 733 Craig project and when implemented will introduce Carolina Cherry and pittosporum trees along the common property line.

The second floor on the north side has limited windows. On the property to the north, immediately adjacent to the share property line is the neighbors garage which aids in screening the new second floor on that side.

In summary, staff has no concerns with the scale, design and siting of the home, which respects the size and constraints of the lot and integrates well with the character of the immediate area.

Findings

1. The two-story design includes adequate setbacks, screening and modulation.

The project offers compliant front and side-yard setbacks and an increased rear-yard setback. Ample building modulation is apparent in the footprint, recession between floor levels, well-proportioned roof form and central front porch. Existing landscape screening on the neighboring properties as well as the northerly neighbor's detached garage aid in screening the new second floor. Enhancement to existing screening is

not regarded as necessary. Staff supports the finding.

2. The two-story design preserves the existing scale and character of the surrounding neighborhood.

The area is characterized by numerous two-story homes of varied size and design, including adjacent homes to the north, east and west, while the home's position on the subject lot and associated visibility would not upset the prevailing street setting. Staff supports the finding.

3. The two-story design protects public views, aesthetics, privacy and property values of the neighbors.

The project's scale is not excessive given the character of the area and public views would not be significantly compromised while the second-floor window arrangements on the north and east sides are distant, reasonable and sensitive to neighboring properties. Staff supports the finding.

4. The two-story design is consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines as adopted by resolution of the City Council.

The scale and design of the project, with its efficient form, refined massing and detail, is appropriate for both the site and area, and would be consistent with the primary directives of the City's Residential Design Guidelines as related to neighborhood and streetscape compatibility. Staff supports the finding.

D. Summary / Recommendation:

Based on the above discussion, the project is reasonably sited and designed in relation to the subject property and immediate area, and, as conditioned, would have no adverse offsite impacts. Staff therefore recommends that the request **BE APPROVED**, subject to conditions listed in Exhibit "A", attached to the draft resolution.

C: *Sueng Choon Lim / 4365 Chevy Chase Drive / La Canada Flintridge, CA / 91011*
De Angelis Designs / 650 Foothill Blvd., Suite E / La Canada Flintridge, CA / 91011

CITY OF LA CAÑADA FLINTRIDGE

RESOLUTION NO. 17-XX

A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF LA CAÑADA FLINTRIDGE APPROVING SECOND-FLOOR REVIEW 15-22 FOR CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW TWO-STORY SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE AT 4824 COMMONWEALTH AVENUE AS REQUESTED BY SUENG CHOON LIM

WHEREAS, a request by De Angelis Designs on behalf of Sueng Choon Lim has been received for Second-Floor Review to allow the construction of a new two-story residence, said request attached hereto and incorporated herein by reference; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission, on February 14, 2017, after public noticing in the prescribed manner, held a public hearing and conducted a review of the request; and

WHEREAS, the Commission reviewed the project and determined that no significant environmental impacts would result from the project, which is Categorically Exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act, under Section 2.5(c)(1)(new construction) of the City of La Cañada Flintridge Guidelines for the implementation of CEQA; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission has reviewed the facts contained in the staff report dated February 14, 2017, regarding the application for Second-Floor Review at 4824 Commonwealth Avenue, and heard and considered the testimony of the applicant and the public; and

WHEREAS, based on the evidence presented by the application materials, staff report, and public testimony, the Planning Commission finds the following:

Section 1:

Second-floor Review:

1. The two-story design includes adequate setbacks, screening and modulation because the project offers compliant front and side-yard setbacks and an increased rear-yard setback. Ample building modulation is apparent in the footprint, recession between floor levels, well-proportioned roof form and central front porch. Existing landscape screening on the neighboring properties as well as the northerly neighbor's detached garage aid in screening the new second floor. Enhancement to existing screening is not regarded as necessary.
2. The two-story design preserves the existing scale and character of the surrounding neighborhood because the area is characterized by numerous two-

story homes of varied size and design, including adjacent homes to the north, east and west, while the home's position on the subject lot and associated visibility would not upset the prevailing street setting.

3. The two-story design protects public views, aesthetics, privacy and property values of the neighbors because the project's scale is not excessive given the character of the area and public views would not be significantly compromised while the second-floor window arrangements on the north and east sides are distant, reasonable and sensitive to neighboring properties.
4. The two-story design is consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines as adopted by resolution of the City Council because the scale and design of the project, with its efficient form, refined massing and detail, is appropriate for both the site and area, and would be consistent with the primary directives of the City's Residential Design Guidelines as related to neighborhood and streetscape compatibility.

Section 2:

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Planning Commission approves the Second-floor Review request at 4824 Commonwealth Avenue, subject to the conditions listed in Exhibit "A", attached to this resolution.

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED this 14th day of February, 2017.

Chair of the Planning Commission

ATTEST:

Secretary to the Planning Commission

EXHIBIT "A"
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL
SECOND-FLOOR REVIEW 15-21
4824 Commonwealth Avenue

Standard Conditions:

1. Compliance with and execution of all conditions listed herein shall be necessary prior to obtaining final building inspection clearance and/or prior to obtaining any occupancy clearance. Deviation from this requirement shall be only by written consent of the Director of Community Development.
2. This approval is granted for the land or land use as described in the application and any attachments thereto, and as shown on the site plan submitted, labeled Second-Floor Review 15-22.
3. Prior to obtaining a building permit or when applicable initiation of use, the applicant and property owner shall file with the Secretary of the Planning Commission written acknowledgment of the conditions stated herein on forms provided by the Planning Department.
4. All structures, site work and other features including but not limited to, buildings, roadways, parking areas, landscaping and other facilities shall be located and maintained as shown on the project plans labeled Second-floor Review 15-22, Sheets 1-5, except as otherwise stated in these conditions.
5. This approval will expire unless "start of construction" is commenced within 12 months after recordation of Parcel Map 73402. The Director of Community Development may extend the original expiration date by as much as 12 months upon receipt of a written request from the applicant prior to expiration of the original approval if the approved project and applicable zoning standards are unchanged. Start of construction is defined as:
 - a. All zoning and related approvals are effective; and
 - b. All required building and grading permits for the project have been issued; and
 - c. The "foundation inspection" and "concrete slab or underfloor inspection" have been made and received approval from the Division of Building and Safety; i.e., all trenches must be excavated, forms erected, and all materials for the foundation delivered on the job and all in-slab or underfloor building service equipment, conduit, piping accessories and other ancillary equipment items must be in place. Nothing in this definition shall be construed to alter the applicable legal standards for determining when vested property rights to complete the project have arisen.
6. All applicable requirements of any law, ordinance, or regulation of the City of La Cañada Flintridge shall be complied with.

7. This approval is subject to the applicant paying all fees, deposits and assessments to the City of La Cañada Flintridge, as established by policy, ordinance or resolution of the City Council prior to occupancy or initiation of use. This includes payment for contracted staff services as invoiced to the city.
8. In the event the City determines that it is necessary to take legal action to enforce any of the provisions of these conditions, and such legal action is taken, the applicant agrees to pay any and all costs of such legal action, including reasonable attorney's fees, incurred by the City, even if the matter is not prosecuted to a final judgment or is amicably resolved, unless the City should otherwise agree with the applicant to waive said fees or any part thereof. The foregoing shall not apply if the permittee prevails in the enforcement proceeding.
9. The applicant shall defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City and its officers, agents, and employees from any claim, action or proceeding against the City or its officers, agents, or employees to attack, set aside, void, or annul approval of this project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any such claim, action, or proceeding and shall cooperate fully in the defense.
10. An approval granted by the Planning Commission does not constitute a building permit or authorization to begin any construction. An appropriate permit issued by the Division of Building and Safety must be obtained prior to construction, enlargement, relocation, conversion, or demolition of any building or structure within the City.
11. All construction/contractor parking shall be on-site only. If it is deemed that sufficient on-site parking may not be available, then on-street parking in front of the site will be permitted if it can be demonstrated that such parking will not interfere with the immediate neighbors, and will not interfere with the public's use of the surrounding streets. If this cannot be found, then any additional construction vehicle or equipment parking must occur off-site at a location approved by the Director of Community Development. Approval of the off-site location shall be based on the submittal of a Parking Management Plan by the applicant that demonstrates that the site shall not interfere with the neighbors in the area or hinder the public's use of the surrounding streets. Contractors and construction workers will be required to carpool to the construction site. No construction, no deliveries and no movement of construction materials shall occur on Sundays or City recognized holidays.
12. Any subsequent substantive change to these approved plans by the Fire Department or any other agency having subsequent approval authority shall cause these plans to be returned to the Planning Commission for additional review and approval prior to permit issuance.
13. Unless this approval is appealed to the City Council, story poles shall be removed promptly (within one week) after expiration of the 15-day appeal period. Verification of this shall be required prior to submittal of the project for plan check OR prior to issuance of building permits for those projects where "at-risk" plan check is in process or has already been completed.

Planning Conditions:

14. Applicable tree protection guidelines shall be adhered to during all phases of construction.
15. Primary roof and wall colors shall be reviewed and approved by staff prior to issuance of building permits.
16. Recordation of Parcel Map 73402 shall be required prior to issuance of any building permits.

Public Works Conditions:

17. Show all existing utilities, including sewer mainline and lateral on site plan.
18. Project shall comply with Los Angeles County's Low Impact Development Standard as deemed applicable.
19. Provide Traverse closures calculation for lot lines.
20. This project disturbs less than one acre of land, the project is subject to the following minimum construction requirements:
 - Sediments from areas disturbed by construction shall be retained on site, using structural drainage controls to the maximum extent practicable, and stockpiles of soil shall be properly contained to minimize sediment transport from the site to streets, drainage facilities, or adjacent properties via runoff, vehicle tracking, or wind.
 - Construction-related materials, wastes, spills or residues shall be retained on site to minimize transport from the site to streets, drainage facilities, or adjoining properties by wind or runoff.
 - Runoff from equipment and vehicle washing shall be contained at construction sites unless treated to remove sediments and pollutants.
21. Prior to any construction (including, but not limited to, drive approaches, sidewalks, curb and gutter, etc.), trenching or grading within public or private street right-of-way, the applicant shall submit a street improvement plan consistent with the approved Site Plan and conditions of approval and obtain encroachment permits from the Engineering Division.
22. Construct a new concrete driveway approach per City's requirement.
23. Any proposed mailbox structure shall be approved and permitted by Public Works.

* * * * *