

# CITY OF LA CAÑADA FLINTRIDGE

## PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

January 24, 2019 Meeting

**Case Type / Numbers:**  
Second-Floor Review 18-21

**Property Owner:**  
Brian and Starr Obringer  
647 De Nova Street  
La Cañada Flintridge, CA 91011

**Applicant:**  
Craig Stoddard  
C.A. Stoddard A.I.A. and Associates Inc.

**Project Location:**  
647 De Nova Street  
(AIN 5815-018-006)

**Project Planner:**  
Gary Yesayan – Assistant Planner



### 1. Request:

The request is for a Second-Floor Review to add 1,276 square foot second-floor level to an existing 1,707 square foot residence at 647 De Nova Street. All new second-floor additions are subject to Planning Commission review. The project qualifies as new due to removal of more than 30 percent of the roof of the existing single-story residence.

### 2. Location:

The project site is a corner lot located at the intersection of Oakwood Avenue and De Nova Street, north of Interstate 210 Foothill Freeway. The site is located in the R-1-10,000 zone.

### 3. Staff Recommendation:

Staff recommends **APPROVAL** of the Second-Floor Review 18-21, subject to conditions listed in Exhibit "A", attached to the draft resolution.

**4. Project Scope:**

Lot Area – Gross:		11,550 S.F.
Lot Area – Net (exclusive of 875 S.F. street easement):		10,675 S.F.
<b>Maximum Allowed Buildable Area:</b>		<b>3,755 S.F.</b>
	Existing	Proposed
First-Floor Area:	1,850 S.F.	2,023 S.F.
Second-Floor Area:	-	1,276 S.F.
Non-Exempt Volume Space:	-	15 S.F.
Detached Garage Area:	-	441 S.F.
<b>Total Project Floor Area:</b>	-	<b>3,755 S.F.</b>

**5. General Plan / Zoning / Existing Land Use:**

The General Plan Land Use Map identifies the site as Low Density Residential (up to four dwelling units per acre). The property is zoned R-1-10,000 (Single-Family Residential, 10,000 square foot minimum lot size). The lot is currently developed with a single-family residence and attached garage.

**6. California Environmental Quality Act Review:**

Staff has determined that the proposed project is Categorical Exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures).

**7. Previous Actions:**

None

**8. Pending and Potential Actions:**

Building and Safety plan check and issuance of building permits.

---

**9. Staff Analysis:**

A. Context:

De Nova is a private street extending east from Oakwood Avenue, located within the R-1-10,000 zone. Homes along De Nova Street are predominantly single-story; however, along Oakwood Avenue where the subject site has its lengthier side property line, several two-story homes are present. Properties within the general area include trees and landscaping that provide screening and separation between neighboring lots, including a large 48-inch Oak at the southwest corner of the subject property which would also provide screening of the new structure when observed from Oakwood Avenue near De Nova Street.

B. Project Description:

The interior and the roof of the existing single-story residence would be demolished, qualifying the project as new. A new, traditional two-story house with a detached garage will be introduced to the site. The previously attached garage would be incorporated with the first floor and converted into habitable space. The total first-floor area is proposed at 2,023-square feet. The second-floor would comprise 1,276-square feet. The residence includes an entry foyer with 213-square foot of volume space (*vaulted ceiling area above 12-feet*). Pursuant to City’s Zoning Code, 198-square foot of said volume space is exempt, with 15-square feet contributing to the total floor area. A detached, 441-square foot two-car garage would be located behind the residence and accessed from Oakwood Avenue. The overall floor area of the residence would total 3,755-square feet. This is the maximum floor-area permitted for this site.

C. Second-Floor Review:

The project site is a corner lot located at the intersection of Oakwood Avenue and De Nova Street. While the house faces south toward De Nova Street, it has a larger presence along Oakwood Avenue where the garage and garage access are located. Oakwood Avenue includes both of single-story and two-story homes within the proximity of the project site. While the Zoning Code allows for a maximum height of 32’-0” within this area, the proposed new two-story residence will remain below this standard at 26’-4”. Since the lot is a corner lot with an average lot width of 70’-0”, the house and the garage along Oakwood Avenue (west side) are required to have a minimum setback of 14’-0” (20 percent of the average lot width). This applies to the garage, the first-floor, and second-floor levels. The proposed two-story house and the garage meet and exceed this requirement. The east side-setback minimum requirement is 7’-0” for the first-floor and 14’-0” for the second floor. The new two-story house would also comply with this standard. The main structure is required to maintain a minimum of 15’-0” of rear yard setback which is the site’s north property line. The conforms with this standard and would be 51’-8” from the rear (north) property line. Per City of La Cañada Flintridge Zoning Code Section 11.11.050.C.7.c., the proposed garage would qualify for a reduced rear-yard setback of 5’-0”, which is proposed for this property. The chart below shows the Zoning Code minimum requirements for setback and height and the proposed project’s figures.

Setbacks and Height:

	<b>Standard</b>	<b>Proposed</b>
Front Setback:	32’-6”	32’-8”
First-Floor Setback (East Interior-Side):	7’-0”	House: 8’-0” Chimney: 7’-0” Garage: 35’-1”
First-Floor Setback (West Street-Side):	14’-0”	House: 20’-8” Trellis: 18’-1” Garage: 14’-0”
Second-Floor Setback (East Interior-Side):	14’-0”	14’-5”
Second-Floor Setback (West Street-Side):	14’-0”	20’-8”
Rear-Yard Setback:	House: 15’-0” * Garage: 5’-0”	House: 51’-8” * Garage: 5’-0”
Height:	32’-0”	26’-4”

\* Reduced garage setback per LCF ZC 11.11.050.C.7.c

## Findings:

- 1. The two-story design includes adequate setbacks, screening and modulation** since the new two-story house would provide a front-yard setback of 32'-8", consistent with the minimum requirement of 32'-6" based on the neighboring average. The minimum street side-yard setback requirement is 14'-0". The house would be located 20'-8", an attached trellis would be 18'-1" and the garage is proposed at 14'-0" from the west property line (street side-yard setback) compliant with the minimum code requirement of 14'-0". The first and second-floor levels and the garage are in conformance with the minimum east side-yard setback requirement of 7'-0" for the first-floor and 14'-0" for the second-floor. Compliant rear yard setback for the garage and the main residence is also provided. A large Oak tree at the corner of Oakwood Avenue and De Nova Street would provide screening of the new structure. Modulation is apparent given the asymmetry along the front façade, consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines, as well as incorporation of multiple roof lines. The structure provides distinct visual as well as physical separation between the first and second-floor levels. *Staff supports the finding.*
- 2. The two-story design preserves the existing scale and character of the surrounding neighborhood** since the surrounding neighborhood consists of both two-story and single-story homes. The subject site and the general neighborhood includes relatively flat parcels, allowing for a maximum structural height of up to 32'-0" per the Zoning Code. However, neighboring homes, as well as the proposed new two-story residence, would remain below the maximum permitted height. As such, given its architectural character, site placement and design, the new two-story house would be in alignment and consistent with existing two-story and single-story homes in the area. The scale and character of the surrounding neighborhood would not be negatively impacted. *Staff supports the finding.*
- 3. The two-story design protects public views, aesthetics, privacy and property values of the neighbors** as the site is not subject to sensitive or significant public views, and the new two-story structure would not block or negatively impact any potential public views. The two-story house would include a single-story front entry-porch and a second-floor that is smaller than the first-floor footprint. This would provide a human-scale proportion and aesthetically attractive design. To maintain privacy, the residence lacks second-floor balconies along its east elevation where the neighboring privacy impact would potentially be the most significant. At the second-floor level, two bathroom and two bedroom windows would be located 14'-5" away from the east property line. The new two-story residence would remain below the 32'-0" maximum permitted height at 26'-4". As such, public views, aesthetics, and privacy would not be impacted. The two-story design does not indicate a negative impact on the neighboring property values. *Staff supports the finding.*
- 4. The two-story design is consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines as adopted by resolution of the City Council** since the residence would be compatible for the neighborhood and will provide setbacks that meet and exceed

the minimum Zoning Code requirement. The scale and bulk of the building is appropriate for the site and the general area. The height of the entry porch, architectural modulation, building bulk and all other design elements are consistent with all the sections of the Residential Design Guidelines; therefore, the project is consistent with the primary directives of the City's Residential Design Guidelines and complies with all four of its main sections. *Staff supports the finding.*

D. Recommendation:

Based on the above discussion and findings, staff recommends **APPROVAL** of the Second-Floor Review 18-21, subject to the conditions listed in Exhibit "A", attached to the draft resolution.

E. Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution and Conditions of Approval
2. Project Site and Story Pole Photos

RESOLUTION NO. 19-xx

**A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF LA CAÑADA FLINTRIDGE APPROVING SECOND-FLOOR REVIEW 18-21 FOR A 3,314-SQUARE FOOT TWO-STORY RESIDENCE WITH A DETACHED 441-SQUARE FOOT GARAGE AT 647 DE NOVA STREET AND FINDING THE PROJECT EXEMPT PURSUANT TO SECTION 15303 OF THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT**

**WHEREAS**, an application for Second-Floor Review was filed by C.A. Stoddard A.I.A. and Associates Inc., with the City of La Cañada Flintridge; and

**WHEREAS**, Second-Floor Review 18-21 is a request for a new two-story residence with a detached two-car garage totaling 3,755-square feet, located at 647 De Nova Street (AIN: 5815-018-006), said requests attached hereto and incorporated herein by reference; and

**WHEREAS**, the subject site has a General Plan Land Use designation of Low Density Residential (up to four dwelling units per acre) and is located within the R-1-10,000 Zone designation; and

**WHEREAS**, it has been determined that the proposed project is Categorically Exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures); and

**WHEREAS**, on January 24, 2019, a duly noticed public hearing for the Second-Floor Review 18-21 was held before the City of La Cañada Flintridge Planning Commission at the Council Chamber within City Hall, 1327 Foothill Boulevard, La Cañada Flintridge; and

**WHEREAS**, the Planning Commission has reviewed the facts contained in the staff report dated January 24, 2019, regarding the Second-Floor Review 18-21, and heard and considered the testimony of the Applicant and the public; including any written correspondence received, with all testimony received being made a part of the public record; and

**WHEREAS**, all legal prerequisites to the adoption of this Resolution have occurred.

**NOW THEREFORE**, the Planning Commission of the City of La Cañada Flintridge does resolve as follows:

## **Section 1:**

Findings: Second-Floor Review 18-21

1. **The two-story design includes adequate setbacks, screening and modulation** since the new two-story house would provide a front-yard setback of 32'-8", consistent with the minimum requirement of 32'-6" based on the neighboring average. The minimum street side-yard setback requirement is 14'-0". The house would be located 20'-8", an attached trellis would be 18'-1" and the garage is proposed at 14'-0" from the west property line (street side-yard setback) compliant with the minimum code requirement of 14'-0". The first and second-floor levels and the garage are in conformance with the minimum east side-yard setback requirement of 7'-0" for the first-floor and 14'-0" for the second-floor. Compliant rear yard setback for the garage and the main residence is also provided. A large Oak at the corner of Oakwood Avenue and De Nova Street would provide screening of the new structure. Modulation is apparent given the asymmetry along the front façade, consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines, as well as incorporation of multiple roof lines. The structure provides distinct visual as well as physical separation between the first and second-floor levels.
2. **The two-story design preserves the existing scale and character of the surrounding neighborhood** since the surrounding neighborhood consists of both two-story and single-story homes. The subject site and the general neighborhood includes relatively flat parcels, allowing for a maximum structural height of up to 32'-0" per the Zoning Code. However, neighboring homes, as well as the proposed new two-story residence, would remain below the maximum permitted height. As such, given its architectural character, site placement and design, the new two-story house would be in alignment and consistent with existing two-story and single-story homes in the area. The scale and character of the surrounding neighborhood would not be negatively impacted.
3. **The two-story design protects public views, aesthetics, privacy and property values of the neighbors** as the site is not subject to sensitive or significant public views, and the new two-story structure would not block or negatively impact any potential public views. The two-story house would include a single-story front entry-porch and a second-floor that is smaller than the first-floor footprint. This would provide a human-scale proportion and aesthetically attractive design. To maintain privacy, the residence lacks second-floor balconies along its east elevation where the neighboring privacy impact would potentially be the most significant. At the second-floor level, two bathroom and two bedroom windows would be located 14'-5" away from the east property line. The new two-story residence would remain below the 32'-0" maximum permitted height at 26'-4". As such, public views, aesthetics, and privacy would not be impacted. The two-story design does not indicate a negative impact on the neighboring property values.

4. **The two-story design is consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines as adopted by resolution of the City Council** since the residence would be compatible for the neighborhood and will provide setbacks that meet and exceed the minimum Zoning Code requirement. The scale and bulk of the building is appropriate for the site and the general area. The height of the entry porch, architectural modulation, building bulk and all other design elements are consistent with all the sections of the Residential Design Guidelines; therefore, the project is consistent with the primary directives of the City's Residential Design Guidelines and complies with all four of its main sections.

**Section 2.** CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT. Based upon the foregoing facts and based upon substantial evidence, the Planning Commission hereby finds as follows:

A. The project is not subject to the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA") pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures). None of the exceptions to the exemptions identified within Section 15300.2 apply to the proposed project. The Planning Commission hereby directs staff to file a Notice of Exemption for Second-Floor Review 18-21.

**Section 3.** Based on the above findings, the Planning Commission of the City of La Cañada Flintridge hereby approves Second-Floor Review 18-21 for the project at 647 De Nova Street, subject to the conditions of approval listed in Exhibit "A", attached to this resolution.

**PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED this 24th day of January 2019**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chair of the Planning Commission

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Secretary to the Planning Commission



**EXHIBIT A  
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL  
SECOND-FLOOR REVIEW 18-21  
647 DE NOVA STREET  
(AIN# 5815-018-006)**

1. Compliance with and execution of all conditions listed herein shall be necessary prior to obtaining final building inspection clearance and/or prior to obtaining any occupancy clearance. Deviation from this requirement shall be only by written consent of the Director of Community Development.
2. This approval is granted for the land or land use as described in the application and any attachments thereto, and as shown on the site plan submitted, labeled SFR 18-21 and stamped approved on January 24, 2019.
3. Prior to obtaining a building permit or when applicable initiation of use, the applicant and property owner shall file with the Secretary of the Planning Commission written acknowledgment of the conditions stated herein on forms provided by the Planning Department.
4. All structures, site work and other features including but not limited to, buildings, roadways, parking areas, landscaping and other facilities shall be located and maintained as shown on the project plans labeled SFR 18-21, except as otherwise stated in these conditions.
5. This approval will expire unless "start of construction" is commenced within 24 months after approval is granted and diligently pursued thereafter. The Director of Community Development may extend the original expiration date by as much as 12-months upon receipt of a written request from the applicant prior to expiration of the original approval if the approved project and applicable zoning standards are unchanged. Start of construction is defined as:
  - a. All zoning and related approvals are effective; and
  - b. All required building and grading permits for the project have been issued; and
  - c. The "foundation inspection" and "concrete slab or underfloor inspection" have been made and received approval from the Department of Building and Safety; i.e., all trenches must be excavated, forms erected, and all materials for the foundation delivered on the job and all in-slab or underfloor building service equipment, conduit, piping accessories and other ancillary equipment items must be in place. Nothing in this definition shall be construed to alter the applicable legal standards for determining when vested property rights to complete the project have arisen.
6. All applicable requirements of any law, ordinance, or regulation of the City of La Cañada Flintridge shall be complied with.

7. This approval is subject to the applicant paying all fees and assessments to the City of La Cañada Flintridge, as established by Resolution of the City Council.
8. In the event the City determines that it is necessary to take legal action to enforce any of the provisions of these conditions, and such legal action is taken, the applicant agrees to pay any and all costs of such legal action, including reasonable attorney's fees, incurred by the City, even if the matter is not prosecuted to a final judgment or is amicably resolved, unless the City should otherwise agree with the applicant to waive said fees or any part thereof. The foregoing shall not apply if the permittee prevails in the enforcement proceeding.
9. The applicant shall defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City and its officers, agents, and employees from any claim, action or proceeding against the City or its officers, agents, or employees to attack, set aside, void, or annul approval of this Second-Floor Review. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any such claim, action, or proceeding and shall cooperate fully in the defense.
10. An approval granted by the Planning Commission does not constitute a building permit or authorization to begin any construction. An appropriate permit issued by the Department of Building and Safety must be obtained prior to construction, enlargement, relocation, conversion, or demolition of any building or structure within the City.
11. All construction/contractor parking shall be on-site only. If it is deemed by the Director of Community Development that sufficient on-site parking may not be available, then on-street parking in front of the site will be permitted if it can be demonstrated that such parking will not interfere with the immediate neighbors and will not interfere with the public's use of the surrounding streets. If this cannot be found, then any additional construction vehicle or equipment parking must occur off-site at a location approved by the Director of Community Development. Approval of the off-site location shall be based on the submittal of a Parking Management Plan by the applicant that demonstrates that the site shall not interfere with the neighbors in the area or hinder the public's use of the surrounding streets. Contractors and construction workers will be required to carpool to the construction site. No construction, no deliveries and no movement of construction materials shall occur on Sundays or City recognized holidays.
12. Prior to building permit issuance, a Landscape Plan shall be submitted to the Planning Department for review and approval by the Director of Community Development. New construction projects with an aggregate landscape area equal to or greater than five hundred (500) square feet shall comply with Chapter 4.23 Water Efficient Landscaping. Prior to final inspection, a Certificate of Completion for Water Efficient Landscaping shall be submitted and approved.
13. Prior to final building inspection, structures, including pilasters, fences and gates located within the street-side setback (14-feet) and front setback (32'-6") shall be

removed, relocated, or reduced to maximum 42-inches in height. Vehicle gates must be located at least 20-feet from the curb.

Public Works Conditions:

14. Provide drainage plan. All onsite surface runoff shall be clarified prior to discharging to public storm drain Channel.
15. Project shall comply with Los Angeles County's Low Impact Development Standards.
16. This project **disturbs less than one acre of land**, the project is subject to the following minimum construction requirements:
  - Sediments from areas disturbed by construction shall be retained on site, using structural drainage controls to the maximum extent practicable, and stockpiles of soil shall be properly contained to minimize sediment transport from the site to streets, drainage facilities, or adjacent properties via runoff, vehicle tracking, or wind.
  - Construction-related materials, wastes, spills or residues shall be retained on site to minimize transport from the site to streets, drainage facilities, or adjoining properties by wind or runoff.
  - Runoff from equipment and vehicle washing shall be contained at construction sites unless treated to remove sediments and pollutants.
17. Remove existing pilasters in public right of way.
18. Provide covenants for brick driveway approaches in public right of way.
19. Prior to any construction (including, but not limited to, drive approaches, sidewalks, curb and gutter, etc.), trenching or grading within public or private street right-of-way, the Applicant shall submit a street improvement plan consistent with the approved Site Plan and Conditions of approval and obtain encroachment permit(s) from the Public Works Department.

CONSTRUCTION & DEMOLITION (C&D) DEBRIS

20. Project shall comply with City's Construction and Demolition (C&D) Ordinance 313, per Chapter 9.14 of the City Municipal Code to satisfy the City's Debris Management requirement.
21. Prior to Demolition and/or Building Permit issuance, the Applicant shall submit a Performance Security, calculated as the lesser of three percent (3%) of the total project valuation or \$10,000. The Performance Security is refunded upon Applicant's submittal and approval of a Building Debris Management Report indicating that at least 50% of the total debris generated by the project was reused or recycled.

22. Prior to Final Building Inspection, Applicant shall submit a Building Debris Management Report and obtain Public Works approval. The Building & Safety Department will not complete Final Building Inspection until the Public Works Department makes a determination regarding refund or forfeiture of the Performance Security.
23. Applicant must use a City authorized and permitted waste hauler for all debris, including soil import/export, resulting from construction and demolition activities on the project. A list of authorized waste haulers will be provided to the Applicant.
24. Self-hauling of C&D debris must be authorized by the Department of Public Works prior to Building & Safety issuance of Demolition or Building permit(s). Applicant must submit a Debris Management Plan and a Haul Route Plan, execute a self-haul agreement, as well as fund a Haul Route Manager for monitoring of all self-hauling activities. Self-hauling approval must be acquired from the Public Works Department prior to issuance of any permit(s).

# # # # #

DRAFT



**Front of the Residence**



De Nova St  
PVT  
6000



Oakwood Ave.

De Nova St.