

	<u>ORIGINAL PROPOSAL</u>	<u>FLIPPED DESIGN</u>	<u>NOT FLIPPED REDUCED HEIGHT</u>
Floor Area:	3,819 S.F.	Unchanged	Unchanged
Front SB:	38'-1"	Unchanged	Unchanged
North Side SB			
1st floor:	8'-0"	12'-9"	8'-0"
2nd floor:	16'-0"	16'-1"	16'-0"
South Side SB			
1st floor:	13'-1"	8'-5"	13'-1"
2nd floor:	16'-5"	16'-5"	16'-5"
Rear SB:	49'-0"	Unchanged	Unchanged
Height:	30'-4"	28'-1"	28'-9"

Staff views the flipped redesign as problematic, since four trees (three protected) would have to be removed to accomplish the redesign; and no discernable separation would be achieved on the second-floor level on the north side. Although, the street tree could be saved if the driveway was redesigned to take access between the protected street trees. The redesign would, however, eliminate one of the second-floor windows on the north side. Additional windows would also be added on the north side at the first-floor level. Staff does not support the flipped design since the gain in separation at the second-floor level of the north side would be negligible and would require the removal of protected trees. Additionally, the Public Works Director has indicated that the removal of the street tree would require the approval of the Public Works and Traffic Commission. The A/C condensers would not satisfy the 8'-0" setback requirement on the south side. Lastly, since the first-floor side-yard setback was increased on the north side of the flipped design the retaining wall on the north side was shifted to south. This would allow for a planting bed for new screening, as well as, Fire Department access.

The applicant has also provided a non-flipped design which provides the original layout with a lowered roof line (dated 3/8/17). This design preserves the two oak trees and the Public Right-of-Way tree, allows for compliant setbacks for the A/C compressor and provides the original 16'-0" of separation for the new second floor on the north side. The preservation of the two oak trees provides screening of the project from the south side future neighbor which is actually closer than the north side neighbor. This redesign also allows a portion of the retaining wall on the north to be shifted south to allow for the planting bed and Fire Department access. The originally proposed windows on the second floor would also be retained. Staff supports this third design of the original layout, same setbacks and lowered roof.

In both redesigns, the height reduction was achieved by lowering the pad and the roof pitch.

Staff added a condition of approval that full-size plans be submitted of the final approved design for the project file, as well as, a condition to provide screening along the north side property line.

2. Staff Recommendation:

Based on the above discussion, staff believes that the original layout with the lowered pad and roof, as well as, the relocated retaining wall with increased planting bed area is appropriate for the site and area and would recommend that the Second-Floor Review request **BE APPROVED**, subject to conditions listed in Exhibit "A", attached to the draft resolution.

Attachments:

Draft Resolution

Previous Staff Report dated February 14, 2017

Reduced Plans labeled "Original Design"

Reduced Plans labeled "Flipped Design" dated 3/6/17

Reduced Plans labeled "Not Flipped/Lower Roof Line" dated 3/8/17

*cc: Sueng Choon Lim / 4365 Chevy Chase Drive / La Canada Flintridge, CA / 91011
De Angelis Designs / 650 Foothill Blvd., Suite E / La Canada Flintridge, CA / 91011*

CITY OF LA CAÑADA FLINTRIDGE

RESOLUTION NO. 17-XX

A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF LA CAÑADA FLINTRIDGE APPROVING SECOND-FLOOR REVIEW 15-22 FOR CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW TWO-STORY SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE AT 4824 COMMONWEALTH AVENUE AS REQUESTED BY SUENG CHOON LIM

WHEREAS, a request by De Angelis Designs on behalf of Sueng Choon Lim has been received for Second-Floor Review to allow the construction of a new two-story residence, said request attached hereto and incorporated herein by reference; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission, on February 14, 2017, after public noticing in the prescribed manner, held a public hearing, conducted a review of the request and continued the project to a date certain of March 14, 2017; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission, on March 14, 2017, after public noticing in the prescribed manner, held a public hearing and conducted a review of the revised request; and

WHEREAS, the Commission reviewed the project and determined that no significant environmental impacts would result from the project, which is Categorically Exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act, under Section 2.5(c)(1)(new construction) of the City of La Cañada Flintridge Guidelines for the implementation of CEQA; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission has reviewed the facts contained in the staff report dated February 14, 2017, regarding the application for Second-Floor Review at 4824 Commonwealth Avenue, and heard and considered the testimony of the applicant and the public; and

WHEREAS, based on the evidence presented by the application materials, staff report, and public testimony, the Planning Commission finds the following:

Section 1:

Second-floor Review:

1. The two-story design includes adequate setbacks, screening and modulation because the project offers compliant front and side-yard setbacks and an increased rear-yard setback. Ample building modulation is apparent in the footprint, recession between floor levels, well-proportioned roof form and central front porch. Existing landscape screening on the neighboring properties, as well

as, additional conditioned landscape screening on the north side would aid in screening the new second floor.

2. The two-story design preserves the existing scale and character of the surrounding neighborhood because the area is characterized by numerous two-story homes of varied size and design, including adjacent homes to the north, east and west, while the home's position on the subject lot and associated visibility would not upset the prevailing street setting.
3. The two-story design protects public views, aesthetics, privacy and property values of the neighbors because the project's scale is not excessive given the character of the area and public views would not be significantly compromised while the second-floor window arrangements on the north and east sides are distant, reasonable and sensitive to neighboring properties. Additional conditioned screening would minimize any impacts
4. The two-story design is consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines as adopted by resolution of the City Council because the scale and design of the project, with its efficient form, refined massing and detail, is appropriate for both the site and area, and would be consistent with the primary directives of the City's Residential Design Guidelines as related to neighborhood and streetscape compatibility.

Section 2:

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Planning Commission approves the Second-floor Review request at 4824 Commonwealth Avenue, subject to the conditions listed in Exhibit "A", attached to this resolution.

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED this 14th day of March, 2017.

Chair of the Planning Commission

ATTEST:

Secretary to the Planning Commission

EXHIBIT "A"
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL
SECOND-FLOOR REVIEW 15-21
4824 Commonwealth Avenue

Standard Conditions:

1. Compliance with and execution of all conditions listed herein shall be necessary prior to obtaining final building inspection clearance and/or prior to obtaining any occupancy clearance. Deviation from this requirement shall be only by written consent of the Director of Community Development.
2. This approval is granted for the land or land use as described in the application and any attachments thereto, and as shown on the site plan submitted, labeled Second-Floor Review 15-22, dated 3/8/17.
3. Prior to obtaining a building permit or when applicable initiation of use, the applicant and property owner shall file with the Secretary of the Planning Commission written acknowledgment of the conditions stated herein on forms provided by the Planning Department.
4. All structures, site work and other features including but not limited to, buildings, roadways, parking areas, landscaping and other facilities shall be located and maintained as shown on the project plans labeled Second-floor Review 15-22 dated 3/8/17, Sheets 1-5, except as otherwise stated in these conditions.
5. This approval will expire unless "start of construction" is commenced within 12 months after recordation of Parcel Map 73402. The Director of Community Development may extend the original expiration date by as much as 12 months upon receipt of a written request from the applicant prior to expiration of the original approval if the approved project and applicable zoning standards are unchanged. Start of construction is defined as:
 - a. All zoning and related approvals are effective; and
 - b. All required building and grading permits for the project have been issued; and
 - c. The "foundation inspection" and "concrete slab or underfloor inspection" have been made and received approval from the Division of Building and Safety; i.e., all trenches must be excavated, forms erected, and all materials for the foundation delivered on the job and all in-slab or underfloor building service equipment, conduit, piping accessories and other ancillary equipment items must be in place. Nothing in this definition shall be construed to alter the applicable legal standards for determining when vested property rights to complete the project have arisen.

6. All applicable requirements of any law, ordinance, or regulation of the City of La Cañada Flintridge shall be complied with.
7. This approval is subject to the applicant paying all fees, deposits and assessments to the City of La Cañada Flintridge, as established by policy, ordinance or resolution of the City Council prior to occupancy or initiation of use. This includes payment for contracted staff services as invoiced to the city.
8. In the event the City determines that it is necessary to take legal action to enforce any of the provisions of these conditions, and such legal action is taken, the applicant agrees to pay any and all costs of such legal action, including reasonable attorney's fees, incurred by the City, even if the matter is not prosecuted to a final judgment or is amicably resolved, unless the City should otherwise agree with the applicant to waive said fees or any part thereof. The foregoing shall not apply if the permittee prevails in the enforcement proceeding.
9. The applicant shall defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City and its officers, agents, and employees from any claim, action or proceeding against the City or its officers, agents, or employees to attack, set aside, void, or annul approval of this project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any such claim, action, or proceeding and shall cooperate fully in the defense.
10. An approval granted by the Planning Commission does not constitute a building permit or authorization to begin any construction. An appropriate permit issued by the Division of Building and Safety must be obtained prior to construction, enlargement, relocation, conversion, or demolition of any building or structure within the City.
11. All construction/contractor parking shall be on-site only. If it is deemed that sufficient on-site parking may not be available, then on-street parking in front of the site will be permitted if it can be demonstrated that such parking will not interfere with the immediate neighbors, and will not interfere with the public's use of the surrounding streets. If this cannot be found, then any additional construction vehicle or equipment parking must occur off-site at a location approved by the Director of Community Development. Approval of the off-site location shall be based on the submittal of a Parking Management Plan by the applicant that demonstrates that the site shall not interfere with the neighbors in the area or hinder the public's use of the surrounding streets. Contractors and construction workers will be required to carpool to the construction site. No construction, no deliveries and no movement of construction materials shall occur on Sundays or City recognized holidays.
12. Any subsequent substantive change to these approved plans by the Fire Department or any other agency having subsequent approval authority shall cause these plans to be returned to the Planning Commission for additional review and approval prior to permit issuance.

13. Unless this approval is appealed to the City Council, story poles shall be removed promptly (within one week) after expiration of the 15-day appeal period. Verification of this shall be required prior to submittal of the project for plan check OR prior to issuance of building permits for those projects where “at-risk” plan check is in process or has already been completed.

Planning Conditions:

14. Applicable tree protection guidelines shall be adhered to during all phases of construction. Verification of protection shall be provided prior to permit issuance.
15. Primary roof and wall colors shall be reviewed and approved by staff prior to issuance of building permits.
16. Recordation of Parcel Map 73402 shall be required prior to issuance of any building permits.
17. Full size plans of the approved design shall be submitted prior to plan check submittal.
18. A landscape plan shall be reviewed and approved by the Director of Community Development prior to issuance of building permits. Said landscape plan should indicate the correct location of the retaining wall and the species, size, quantity and spacing of the screening along the north property line. Verification of installation shall be required prior to final occupancy.

Public Works Conditions:

19. Show all existing utilities, including sewer mainline and lateral on site plan.
20. Project shall comply with Los Angeles County’s Low Impact Development Standard as deemed applicable.
21. Provide Traverse closures calculation for lot lines.
22. This project disturbs less than one acre of land, the project is subject to the following minimum construction requirements:
 - Sediments from areas disturbed by construction shall be retained on site, using structural drainage controls to the maximum extent practicable, and stockpiles of soil shall be properly contained to minimize sediment transport from the site to streets, drainage facilities, or adjacent properties via runoff, vehicle tracking, or wind.
 - Construction-related materials, wastes, spills or residues shall be retained on site to minimize transport from the site to streets, drainage facilities, or adjoining properties by wind or runoff.

- Runoff from equipment and vehicle washing shall be contained at construction sites unless treated to remove sediments and pollutants.
- 23. Prior to any construction (including, but not limited to, drive approaches, sidewalks, curb and gutter, etc.), trenching or grading within public or private street right-of-way, the applicant shall submit a street improvement plan consistent with the approved Site Plan and conditions of approval and obtain encroachment permits from the Engineering Division.
- 24. Construct a new concrete driveway approach per City's requirement.
- 25. Any proposed mailbox structure shall be approved and permitted by Public Works.

* * * * *